Dear Dr. Sabin:

The attached manuscript by Bernard Roizman, Manfred M. Mayer and Philip R. Hoane, Jr. entitled: Immunochemical Studies of Poliovirus IV.

consists of 15 pages of text and references, 2 tables and 2 figures.

Would you be good enough to review it and return your comments in DUPLICATE as an anonymous memorandum to be transmitted to the author. (The third copy may be retained for your own files). Please use an additional sheet if necessary.

If you cannot referee the manuscript in the next 10-14 days, will you return it for referral to someone else?

Sincerely yours,

JOHN Y. SUGG
Editor-in-Chief

COMMENT: referee # I

The studies reported in this communication provide interesting new information and should be published. I am becoming concerned, however, with what may be an example of "fractional publication". The authors are presenting a series of brief reports each very closely related to a preceding one dealing with immunochemical studies of poliovirus. In each there has to be a repetition of background material, a repetition of description of materials and methods. In the present study for example the authors have dealt with only one aspect of the behavior of poliovirus that has been heated or irradiated with ultraviolet light, i. e. with the reaction of such material with acute phase and convalescent phase human sera. There is, however, another aspect to the effect of heat in ultraviolet light which has to do with the loss of type specificity, that is to say that human sera devoid of neutralizing antibody for a given type of poliovirus may, nevertheless, exhibit complement fixing activity with this type of heated or irradiated poliovirus. Have the authors investigated this question and if so, are we to get still another publication on that particular question? If that should be the case I would recommend that the present paper not be published as a separate communication but should rather be combined with the other data. The authors should also be asked to indicate whether or not the monkey antisera still reacted in a specific way with heated or irradiated virus and if so to comment on the difference between the reactions exhibited by human sera and monkey sera.