Dear Dr. Sabin:

The attached manuscript by: Franklin A. Neva and Saverio M. Zuffante entitled: AGENTS ISOLATED FROM PATIENTS WITH BOSTON EXANTEM DISEASE DURING 1954 IN PITTSBURGH consists of 18 pages of text and references, 4 tables and 0 figures.

Would you be good enough to review it and return your comments in DUPLICATE, as an anonymous memorandum to be transmitted to the author. (The third copy may be retained for your own files). Please use additional sheet if space below is insufficient.

If you cannot referee the manuscript in the next 10-14 days, will you return it to me for referral to someone else?

Sincerely yours,

JOHN Y. SUGG
Editor-in-Chief

COMMENT: first Ref. MS.NO. 521

Beyond the neutralization test with the "Boston" strain of virus summarized in Table I, this communication contains very little of significance that has not already been published in the May, 1956 issue of the New England Journal of Medicine. The author mentions the difficulties encountered in evaluating the precise titer of neutralizing antibody, since a titer of 128 on the 6th day may change to 4 on the 12th day (Table III), and yet does not tell us when the titers reported in Table I were recorded.

I would not recommend publication of this paper until the author supplies additional data needed to characterize these "Echo" viruses sufficiently to permit identification by other investigators. The author should present data on the effect of the known "Echo" and cytopathogenic Coxsackie antisera on his agents. He should also supply data of the effect of a "Boston Exanthem Disease" prototype virus antiserum prepared in monkeys or rabbits on the various strains isolated in Pittsburgh and Boston— an antiserum which may then become available to other investigators for identification of unclassified "Echo" viruses. The author should show a photograph of the cytopathogenic effect on monkey kidney epithelial cells, tell us something of tests on the Pittsburgh strains in newborn mice, and something more about the physical properties and behavior of these viruses. This is the minimum obligation of an investigator reporting a new virus.